# Answers to the Exercises -- Chapter 3

# **SECTION 1**

- 1. a. Fred is an orangutan. Of
  - b. Gertrude is an orangutan but Fred isn't. Gertrude is an orangutan [and] Fred is not [an orangutan]. Og  $\wedge$  ~Of
  - c. Tony Blair will speak first. Fb
  - d. Gary lost weight recently; he is happy. Gary lost weight recently [and] [Gary] is happy. Lg  $\wedge$  Hg
  - e. Felix cleaned and polished. Felix cleaned and [Felix] polished. Cf  $\wedge$  Of
  - f. Darlene or Abe will bat clean-up. Darlene [will bat clean-up] or Abe will bat clean-up. Bd  $\lor$  Ba
- 2. 'D' is true of doctors
  - 'L' is true of people who are in love
  - 'h' stands for Hans
  - 'a' stands for Amanda
  - a. Hans is a doctor but Amanda isn't. Hans is a doctor [and] Amanda is not [a doctor] Dh ∧ ~Da
  - b. Hans, who is a doctor, is in love Hans is in love [and Hans] is a doctor  $Lh \wedge Dh$
  - c. Hans is in love but Amanda isn't Hans is in love [and] Amanda is [not in love] Lh ∧ ~La
  - d. Neither Hans nor Amanda is in love [It is not the case that] (Hans [is in love] or Amanda is in love)  $\sim$ (Lh  $\vee$  La)
  - f. Hans and Amanda are both doctors. Hans is a doctor [and] Amanda is a doctor. Dh  $\wedge$  Da
- 3. 'L' for things that live in Brea 'D' for things that drive to school
  - a. Eileen and Cosi both live in Brea. Eileen lives in Brea and Cosi loves in Brea Le  $\wedge$  Lc
  - b. Eileen drives to school, and so does Hank.
     Eileen drives to school and hank drives to school
     De 
     Dh

- c. If Hank lives in Brea then he drives to school; otherwise he doesn't drive to school. (If Hank lives in Brea then he drives to school) [and] (otherwise he doesn't drive to school) (If Hank lives in Brea then he drives to school) [and] ([if Hank doesn't live in Brea then] he doesn't drive to school)  $(Lh \rightarrow Dh) \land (\sim Lh \rightarrow \sim Dh)$
- d. If David and Hank both live in Brea then David drives to school but Hank doesn't. If (David and Hank both live in Brea) then (David drives to school [and] Hank doesn't [drive to school])  $(Ld \land Lh) \rightarrow (Dd \land \sim Dh)$
- e. Neither Hank nor Eileen live in Brea, yet each of them drives to school. Neither Hank nor Eileen live in Brea, [and] [Hank and Eileen] drive to school.  $\sim$ (Lh  $\vee$  Le)  $\wedge$  (Dh  $\wedge$  De)

### **SECTION 2**

1. For each of the following, say whether it is a formula in official notation, or in informal notation, or not a formula at all. If it is a formula, parse it.

a. Official notation

$$\begin{array}{c} ~\forall x(Fx \rightarrow (Gx \land Hx)) \\ | \\ \forall x(Fx \rightarrow (Gx \land Hx)) \\ | \\ (Fx \rightarrow (Gx \land Hx)) \\ \land \\ Fx \quad (Gx \land Hx) \\ \land \\ Gx \quad Hx \end{array}$$

b. Informal notation

$$\begin{array}{c} \exists x \sim a & \forall Hx \lor \exists yGy \\ \land \\ \exists x \sim a & Hx \lor \exists yGy \\ | & \land \\ \neg a & Hx \exists yGy \\ | & | \\ \neg Gx & Gy \\ | \\ Gx \end{array}$$

c. Official notation

 $\begin{array}{c} \mathsf{\sim}(\mathsf{Gx}\leftrightarrow\mathsf{\sim}\mathsf{Hx})\\ |\\ (\mathsf{Gx}\leftrightarrow\mathsf{\sim}\mathsf{Hx})\\ \land\\ \mathsf{Gx}\sim\mathsf{Hx}\\ |\\ \mathsf{Hx} \end{array}$ 

- d. Not a formula; a quantifier cannot occur outside a quantifier phrase.
- e. Informal notation

```
\begin{array}{c} \mathsf{Fa} \rightarrow (\mathsf{Gb} \leftrightarrow \mathsf{Hc}) \\ \land \\ \mathsf{Fa} \quad (\mathsf{Gb} \leftrightarrow \mathsf{Hc}) \\ \land \\ \mathsf{Gb} \quad \mathsf{Hc} \end{array}
```

- f. Not a formula; a variable can only occur in an atomic formula or a quantifier phrase, and never by itself.
- g. Informal notation

 $\forall x(Gx \leftrightarrow Hx) \rightarrow Ha \land \exists zKz$ Λ  $\forall x(Gx \leftrightarrow Hx) \quad Ha \land \exists zKz$ Λ Ha ∃zKz  $Gx \leftrightarrow Hx$ Λ Gx Hx Kz

#### **SECTION 3**

- 1. a. Sentence  $\exists x(Fx \land \forall y(Gy \lor Hx))$ Ľ∱ \_\_\_
  - b. Not a formula; there is no way to form " $\exists z$ " in our grammar.
  - <u>∃z</u>~(Hz ∧ Gx ∧ ∃xlx) Formula c.
  - d. Formula  $(\sim Gx \rightarrow \forall y(Jx \land Ky \leftrightarrow Lx))$
  - e. Formula  $\exists xGx \leftrightarrow \exists y(Gy \land Hx)$
  - f. Sentence  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow \forall y(Hy \rightarrow \forall z (Iz \rightarrow Hx \land Gz)))$

Sentence g.



- h. Not a formula; there is no way to form " $\forall xy$ " in our grammar.
- i. Not a formula; " $\exists$ y" cannot stand on its own as a subformula. Sentence



#### **SECTION 4**

j.

- 1. a. Something is a sofa and is well built. There is a well-built sofa...
  - b. Everything is such that if it is a sofa then it is well-built. All sofas are well-built.
  - c. Everything is either a sofa or is well-built. Everything is a sofa, unless it's well-built.
  - d. Something is such that it is not a sofa. Something isn't a sofa.
  - e. Everything is such that it is not a sofa. There are no sofas.
  - f. Everything is such that if it is both bell-built and a sofa, then it is comfortable. Every well-built sofa is comfortable.
  - g. Something is comfortable and everything is well-built.
  - h. Something is such that if it is comfortable, then everything is well-built.
- 2. Assume that all giraffes are friendly, and that some giraffes are clever and some aren't.
  - a.  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow Fx)$ True, since all giraffes are friendly.
  - b.  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow Cx)$ False, since not every giraffe is clever.
  - c.  $\exists x (\sim Fx \land Gx)$ False, since every giraffe is friendly.
  - d.  $\exists y(Fy \land Cy)$ True, since giraffes are friendly, and some of them are clever.
  - e.  $\exists z(Gz \land Cz)$ True, since some giraffes are clever.
  - f.  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow \neg Gx)$ False, since not every giraffe isn't a giraffe. (In fact, no giraffe isn't a giraffe, but it only takes one to falsify the symbolic sentence.)

### **SECTION 5a**

- 1. a. Every Handsome Elephant is Friendly.  $\forall x((Hx \land Ex) \rightarrow Fx)$ 
  - b. No handsome elephant is friendly.  $\sim \exists x((Hx \land Ex) \land Fx))$
  - c. Some elephants are not handsome.  $\exists x(Ex \land \neg Hx)$
  - d. Some handsome elephants are friendly.  $\exists x((Hx \land Ex) \land Fx))$
  - e. Each friendly elephant is handsome.  $\forall x((Fx \land Ex) \rightarrow Hx)$
  - f. A handsome elephant is not friendly.  $\exists x((Hx \land Ex) \land \neg Fx)$
  - g. No friendly elephant is handsome.  $\neg \exists x((Fx \land Ex) \land Hx)$

# **SECTION 5b**

1. Suppose that `A' stands for `is a U.S. state', `C' for `is a city', `L' for `is a capital', and `E' for `is in the Eastern time zone'. What are the truth values of these sentences?

- a.  $\forall x(Cx \rightarrow Lx) \dots$  False; Los Angeles is a city but not a capital.
- b.  $\exists x(Cx \land Lx) \dashrightarrow$  True; Sacramento is a city and a capital.
- c. ∃x(Cx ∧ Lx ↔ Ex) --- True, because something makes the biconditional true, by making both sides false. For example, Los Angeles is not a capital, and it is not in the Eastern time zone.
- d.  $\forall x(Cx \land Ex \rightarrow Ax) ---$  False; Philadelphia is not a state.
- e.  $\neg \exists x(Ax \land Ex) --- False$ ; Delaware is a state in the Eastern time zone.
- f.  $\exists x(Cx \land Ex) \land \exists x(Cx \land \sim Ex) \dashrightarrow$  True; Philadelphia is a city in the Eastern time zone and LA is a city outside the eastern time zone.
- g.  $\exists x(Cx \land Ex \land Ax) \dashrightarrow$  False; no city is also a state.
- h.  $\neg \exists x(Cx \land \neg Cx) \dashrightarrow$  True. There is no city which isn't a city.
- 2. a. All Giraffes are spOtted.
  - $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow Ox)$
  - b. All Clever giraffes are spotted.  $\forall x(Gx \land Cx \rightarrow Ox)$
  - c. No clever giraffes are spotted.  $\neg \exists x(Gx \land Cx \land Ox)$
  - d. Every giraffe is either spotted or **D**rab.  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow (Ox \lor Dx))$
  - e. Some giraffes are clever.  $\exists x(Gx \land Cx)$
  - f. Some spotted giraffes are clever.  $\exists x(Ox \land Gx \land Cx)$
  - g. Some giraffes are clever and some aren't. Some giraffes are clever and some [giraffes are not clever].  $\exists x(Gx \land Cx) \land \exists x(Gx \land \sim Cx)$
  - h. Some spotted giraffes aren't clever.  $\exists x(Ox \land Gx \land \sim Cx)$
  - i. No spotted giraffe is clever but every unspotted one is. No spotted giraffe is clever [and] every un-spotted [giraffe] is [clever].  $\neg \exists x(Ox \land Gx \land Cx) \land \forall x(\neg Ox \land Gx \rightarrow Cx)$
  - j. Every clever spotted giraffe is either wIse or Foolhardy.  $\forall x(((Cx \land Sx) \land Gx) \rightarrow (Ix \lor Fx))$
  - k. Either all spotted giraffes are clever, or all clever giraffes are spotted.

 $\forall x(Ox \land Gx \rightarrow Cx) \lor \forall x($ 

- I. Every clever giraffe is foolhardy.  $\forall x(Cx \land Gx \rightarrow Fx)$
- m. If some giraffes are wise then not all giraffes are foolhardy.  $\exists x(Gx \wedge Ix) \to \ \ \forall x(Gx \to Fx)$
- n. All giraffes are spotted if and only if no giraffes aren't spotted.  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow Ox) \leftrightarrow \neg \exists x(Gx \land \neg Ox)$
- o. Nothing is both wise and foolhardy.  $\neg \exists x(Ix \land Fx)$

# **SECTION 5c**

1. a. Only Friendly Elephants are Handsome (ambiguous)

i.  $\forall x(Hx \rightarrow (Fx \land Ex))$ 

ii.  $\forall x((Ex \land Hx) \rightarrow Fx)$ 

- b. If only elephants are friendly, no **G**iraffes are friendly  $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Ex) \rightarrow \neg \exists x(Gx \land Fx)$
- c. Only the **B**rave are f**A**ir.
  - $\forall x(Ax \rightarrow Bx)$
- d. If only elephants are friendly then every elephant is friendly  $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Ex) \rightarrow \forall x(Ex \rightarrow Fx)$
- e. All and only elephants are friendly. All elephants are friendly [and] Only elephants are friendly.  $\forall x(Ex \rightarrow Fx) \land \forall x(Fx \rightarrow Ex)$
- f. If every elephant is friendly, only friendly Animals are elephants (ambiguous)
- i.  $\forall x(Ex \rightarrow Fx) \rightarrow \forall x(Ex \rightarrow (Fx \land Ax))$
- ii.  $\forall x(Ex \rightarrow Fx) \rightarrow \forall x((Ex \land Ax) \rightarrow Fx)$
- g. If any elephants are friendly, all and only giraffes are nasty If some elephants are friendly, (all giraffes are **N**asty and only giraffes are nasty)  $\exists x(Ex \land Fx) \rightarrow (\forall x(Gx \rightarrow Nx) \land \forall x(Nx \rightarrow Gx))$
- h. Among sp**O**tted animals, only giraffes are handsome.  $\forall x(Ox \rightarrow (Hx \rightarrow Gx))$
- i. Among spotted animals, all and only giraffes are handsome  $\forall x(Ox \rightarrow ((Gx \rightarrow Hx) \land (Hx \rightarrow Gx)))$
- j. Only giraffes frolic if annoyed. If a thing froLics if a**N**noyed, it is a giraffe.  $\forall x((Nx \rightarrow Lx) \rightarrow Gx)$

# **SECTION 5d**

- 1. Symbolize these sentences.
  - a. Every Giraffe which Frolics is Happy  $\forall x(Fx \land Gx \rightarrow Hx)$
  - b. Only giraffes which frolic are happy (ambiguous)
  - i.  $\forall x(Gx \land Hx \rightarrow Fx)$
  - ii.  $\forall x(Hx \rightarrow Gx \land Fx)$
  - c. Only giraffes are Animals which are Long-necked.  $\forall x(Ax \land Lx \rightarrow Gx)$
  - d. If only giraffes frolic, every animal which is not a giraffe doesn't frolic.  $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Gx) \rightarrow \forall x(Ax \land \neg Gx \rightarrow \neg Fx)$
  - e. Some giraffe which frolics is long-necked or happy.  $\exists x((Fx \land Gx) \land (Lx \lor Hx))$
  - f. No giraffe which is not happy frolics and is long-necked.  $\neg \exists x((\neg Hx \land Gx) \land (Fx \land Lx))$
  - g. Some giraffe is not both long-necked and happy.  $\exists x(Gx \land \neg(Lx \land Hx))$

### **SECTION 5e**

- 1. a. If a Giraffe is Happy then it Frolics unless it is Lame.  $\forall x(Gx \land Hx \rightarrow Fx \lor Lx)$ 
  - b. A Monkey frolics unless it is not happy.  $\forall x(Mx \rightarrow Fx \lor ~Hx)$
  - c. Among giraffes, only happy ones frolic.  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow (Fx \rightarrow Hx))$
  - d. All and only giraffes are happy if they are not lame.  $\forall x(Gx \leftrightarrow (\sim Lx \rightarrow Hx))$
  - e. A giraffe frolics only if it is happy.  $\forall x(Gx \land Fx \rightarrow Hx)$  or  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow (Fx \rightarrow Hx))$
  - f. Only giraffes frolic if happy.  $\forall x((Hx \rightarrow Fx) \rightarrow Gx)$
  - g. All monkeys are happy if some giraffe is.  $\exists x(Gx \land Hx) \rightarrow \forall x(Mx \rightarrow Hx)$
  - h. Cute monkeys frolic.
  - $\forall x(Cx \land Mx \rightarrow Fx)$
  - i. Giraffes ru**N** and frolic if and only if they are **B**lissful and **E**xultant.  $\forall x(Gx \rightarrow (Ux \land Fx \leftrightarrow Bx \land Ex))$
  - j. If those who are he**A**lthy are not lame, then if they are exultant, they will frolic.  $\forall x((Ax \rightarrow \sim Lx) \rightarrow (Ex \rightarrow Fx))$
  - k. Only giraffes and monkeys are blissful and exultant.  $\forall x(Bx \land Ex \rightarrow Gx \lor Mx)$
  - I. The brave(I) are happy.  $\forall x(Ix \rightarrow Hx)$
  - m. If a giraffe frolics, then no monkey is blissful unless it is.  $\forall x((Gx \land Fx) \rightarrow (Bx \lor \neg \exists y(My \land By)))$
  - n. Giraffes and monkeys frolic if happy.  $\forall x(Gx \lor Mx \to (Hx \to Fx))$

# **SECTION 6**

- 1. a. The sky is Blue Everything that is blue is prEtty
  - $\therefore$  Something is pretty

Be ∀x(Bx → Ex) ∴ ∃xEx

1 Show ∃xEx

2	$Be \rightarrow Ee$	pr2 ui
3	Ee	2 pr1 mp
4	∃xEx	3 eg dd

- b. Every Hyena is Grey. Every hyena is an Animal Jenny is a hyena
  - $\therefore$  Some animal is grey

 $\begin{array}{l} \forall x(Hx \rightarrow Gx) \\ \forall x(Hx \rightarrow Ax) \\ He \\ \therefore \quad \exists x(Ax \wedge Gx) \end{array}$ 

1	<del>Show</del> ∃x(Ax ∧ Gx)	
2	$\text{He} \rightarrow \text{Ge}$	pr1 ui
3	$He \rightarrow Ae$	pr2 ui
4	Ge	pr3 2 mp
5	Ae	pr3 3 mp
6	Ae ∧ Ge	4 5 adj
7	∃x(Ax ∧ Gx)	6 eg dd

 c. If some Hyena is Grey, every hyena is grey Every sCavenger is grey Jenny is a hyena and a scavenger Kathy is a hyena
 ∴ Kathy is grey

 $\begin{array}{l} \exists x(Hx \wedge Gx) \rightarrow \forall x(Hx \rightarrow Gx) \\ \forall x(Cx \rightarrow Gx) \\ He \wedge Ce \\ Ha \\ \therefore Ga \end{array}$ 

1 Show Ga

2	Show ∃x(Hx ∧ Gx)			
3	He	pr3 s		
4	Ce	pr3 s		
5	$Ce \rightarrow Ge$	pr2 ui		
6	Ge	4 5 mp		
7	He ∧ Ge	3 6 adj		
8	∃x(Hx ∧ Gx)	7 eg dd		
9	$\forall x(Hx \rightarrow Gx)$	2 pr1 mp		
10	$Ha \rightarrow Ga$	9 ui		
11	Ga	10 pr4 mp dd		

2. The error is at line 3. It is not permissible to use EI to get an instance of pr2 in the variable z because z occurs already on line 2; this would violate the restriction on IE.

3. No derivations are given for named theorems.

#### **SECTION 8**

1. Symbolize these arguments and provide derivations to validate them. Give an explicit scheme of abbreviation for each.

- a. If history is right (**P**), then if anyone was str**O**ng, **h**ercules was strong. Only those who work out (**M**) are strong, and only those with self-**D**iscipline work out.
  - : If Hercules does not have self-discipline, then either history is not right or nobody is strong.

 $\begin{array}{l} \mathsf{P} \rightarrow (\exists x O x \rightarrow O h) \\ \forall x (O x \rightarrow M x) \land \forall x (M x \rightarrow D x) \\ \therefore \quad \mathsf{\sim D} h \rightarrow (\mathsf{\sim P} \lor \mathsf{\sim} \exists x O x) \end{array}$ 

1 Show ~Dh $\rightarrow$ (~P $\lor$ ~ $\exists$ xOx)				
2	Γ	~Dh	ass cd	
3		$Mh \rightarrow Dh$	pr2 s ui	
4		~Mh	2 3 mt	
5		$Oh \rightarrow Mh$	pr2 s ui	
6		~Oh	4 5 mt	
7		Show ~P ∨ ~∃xOx		
8		Show $\sim P \rightarrow \sim \exists xOx$		
9		~~P	ass cd	
10		P	9 dn	
11		$\exists xOx \rightarrow Oh$	p1 10 mp	
12		~∃xOx	6 11 mt cd	
13		~P∨~∃xOx	8 cdj dd	
14			7 cd	

b. If some Giraffes are not Happy, then all giraffes are Morose. Some giraffes pOnder the mysteries of life.

: If some giraffes are not morose, then some who ponder the mysteries of life are happy.

 $\begin{array}{l} \exists x(Gx \land {\sim} Hx) \rightarrow \forall x(Gx \rightarrow Mx) \\ \exists x(Gx \land Ox) \\ \therefore \ \exists x(Gx \land {\sim} Mx) \rightarrow \exists x(Ox \land Hx) \end{array}$ 

1 Show  $\exists x(Gx \land \neg Mx) \rightarrow \exists x(Ox \land Hx)$ 

ass cd
2 ei
ass id
5 ui
3 s 6 mp
3 s 7 id
4 pr1 mt
9 qn
pr2 ei
10 ui
12 dm
11s dn 13 mtp dn
11s 14 adj
15 eg cd

- c. There is not a single **C**ritic who either Likes art or can p**A**int. Some level-**H**eaded pe**O**ple are critics. Anyone who can't paint is un**E**ducated.
  - $\therefore$  Some level-headed people are uneducated.

 $\forall x(Cx \rightarrow \ (Lx \lor Ax)) \\ \exists x((Hx \land Ox) \land Cx) \\ \forall x(Ox \rightarrow (\ Ax \rightarrow \ Ex)) \\ \exists x(Ux \land Ox) = \ (Ax \rightarrow \ Ex))$ 

1 ទ	how ∃x((Hx ∧ Ox) ∧ ~Ex)	
2	(Hi ∧ Oi) ∧ Ci	pr2 ei
3	Ci	2 s
4	Hi	2 s s
5	Oi	2 s s
6	$Ci \rightarrow \sim (Li \lor Ai)$	pr1 ui
7	~(Li ∨ Ai)	3 6 mp
8	~Li ∧ ~Ai	7 dm
9	~Ai	8s
10	$Oi \rightarrow (\sim Ai \rightarrow \sim Ei)$	pr3 ui
11	~Ai → ~Ei	5 10 mp
12	~Ei	9 11 mp
13	(Hi ∧ Oi) ∧ ~Ei	2 s 12 adj
14	$\exists x((Hx \land Ox) \land \sim Ex)$	13 eg dd

d. No Astronaut is a good Dancer. Every sInger is warm-Blooded.
If something is warm-blooded and is not a good dancer, then nothing that is either a singer or an astronaut is Exultant.

 $\therefore$  If some astronaut is a singer, then no singer is exultant.

 $\begin{array}{l} \forall x(Ax \rightarrow \sim Dx) \\ \forall x(Ix \rightarrow Bx) \\ \exists x(Bx \land \sim Dx) \rightarrow \forall x((Ix \lor Ax) \rightarrow \sim Ex) \\ \therefore \ \exists x(Ax \land Ix) \rightarrow \forall x(Ix \rightarrow \sim Ex) \end{array}$ 

Show  $\exists x(Ax \land Ix) \rightarrow \forall x(Ix \rightarrow \sim Ex)$ 1 2  $\exists x(Ax \land Ix)$ ass cd 3 Show  $\forall x(Ix \rightarrow \sim Ex)$ 4 Show Ix  $\rightarrow \sim Ex$ 5 ass cd lх 6 Ai∧ li 2 ei 7  $Ai \rightarrow \sim Di$ pr1 ui 8  $Ii \rightarrow Bi$ pr2 ui 9 ~Di 6 s 7 mp 10 6s 8 mp 9 adj Bi∧~Di 11  $\exists x(Bx \land \sim Dx)$ 10 eg 12 11 pr3 mp  $\forall x((Ix \lor Ax) \rightarrow \sim Ex)$ 13 12 ui  $(Ix \lor Ax) \rightarrow \sim Ex$ 14 5 add  $Ix \lor Ax$ 15 ~Ex 13 14 mp cd 16 4 ud 17 3 cd

- e. All stuDents who have a sense of Humor or are Brilliant seek Fame. Anyone who seeks fame and is brilliant is Insecure. Whoever is a Mathematician is brilliant.
  - : Every student who is a mathematician is insecure.

 $\begin{array}{l} \forall x((Dx \land (Hx \lor Bx)) \rightarrow Fx) \\ \forall x(Fx \land Bx \rightarrow Ix) \\ \forall x(Mx \rightarrow Bx) \\ \therefore \quad \forall x((Dx \land Mx) \rightarrow Ix) \end{array}$ 

1 Show  $\forall x((Dx \land Mx) \rightarrow Ix)$ 

2	Show $(Dx \land Mx) \rightarrow Ix$	
3	$Dx \wedge Mx$	ass cd
4	Dx	3 s
5	Mx	3 s
6	$Mx \rightarrow Bx$	pr3 ui
7	Bx	5 6 mp
8	Hx ∨ Bx	7 add
9	$Dx \land (Hx \lor Bx)$	4 8 adj
10	$(Dx \land (Hx \lor Bx)) \to Fx$	pr1 ui
11	Fx	9 10 mp
12	Fx ∧ Bx	7 11 adj
13	$Fx \land Bx \rightarrow Ix$	pr2 ui
14	Ix	12 13 mp cd
15		2 ud

- f. There is a **M**onkey that is **H**appy if and only if some **G**iraffe is happy. There is a monkey that is happy if and only if some giraffe is not happy. All monkeys are happy.
  - $\therefore\,$  It is not the case that either every giraffe is happy or none are.

 $\begin{array}{l} \exists x(Mx \land (Hx \leftrightarrow \exists x(Gx \land Hx)) \\ \exists x(Mx \land (Hx \leftrightarrow \exists x(Gx \land \neg Hx)) \\ \forall x(Mx \rightarrow Hx) \\ \therefore \quad (\forall x(Gx \rightarrow Hx) \lor \forall x(Gx \rightarrow \neg Hx)) \end{array}$ 

1 Show  $\sim (\forall x(Gx \rightarrow Hx) \lor \forall x(Gx \rightarrow \sim Hx))$ 

2	$Mi \land (Hi \leftrightarrow \exists x(Gx \land Hx))$	pr1 ei
3	$Mj \land (Hj \leftrightarrow \exists x(Gx \land \simHx)$	pr2 ei
4	$Mi \rightarrow Hi$	pr3 ui
5	$Mj \rightarrow Hj$	pr3 ui
6	Hi	2 s 4 mp
7	Hj	3 s 5 mp
8	∃x(Gx ∧ Hx)	2 s 6 adj eg
9	∃x(Gx ∧ ~Hx)	3 s 7 adj eg
10	Gk ∧ Hk	8 ei
11	~~Hk	10 s dn
12	Gx ∧ ~~Hk	10 s 11 adj
13	$\sim$ (Gk $\rightarrow$ $\sim$ Hk)	12 nc
14	Gm ∧ ~Hm	9 ei
15	$\sim$ (Gm $\rightarrow$ Hm)	14 nc
16	$\exists x \sim (Gx \rightarrow \sim Hx)$	13 eg
17	$\sim \forall x(Gx \rightarrow \sim Hx)$	16 qn
18	$\exists x \sim (Gx \rightarrow Hx)$	15 eg
19	$\sim \forall x(Gx \rightarrow Hx)$	18 qn
20	$\sim \forall x(Gx \rightarrow Hx) \land \sim \forall x(Gx \rightarrow \sim Hx))$	17 19 adj
21	$\sim$ ( $\forall$ x(Gx $\rightarrow$ Hx) $\vee$ $\forall$ x(Gx $\rightarrow$ $\sim$ Hx))	20 dm dd

- For every Astronaut that writes pOetry, there is one that doesn't. g. For every astronaut that doesn't write poetry, there is one that does.
  - ... If there are any astronauts, some write poetry and some don't.
  - $\forall x ((Ax \land Ox) \rightarrow \exists x (Ax \land \neg Ox))$  $\forall x((Ax \land \neg Ox) \rightarrow \exists x(Ax \land Ox))$  $\therefore \exists xAx \rightarrow \exists x(Ax \land Ox) \land \exists x(Ax \land \neg Ox))$
  - Show  $\exists xAx \rightarrow \exists x(Ax \land Ox) \land \exists x(Ax \land \neg Ox))$

SI	how $\exists xAx \rightarrow \exists x(Ax \land Ox) \land \exists x(Ax \land \sim Ox)$			
	∃xAx	ass cd		
	Ai	2 ei		
	Oi ∨ ~Oi	T59		
	Show $Oi \rightarrow \exists x(Ax \land Ox) \land \exists x(Ax \land \neg Ox)$			
	Oi	ass cd		
	Ai ∧ Oi	3 6 adj		
	∃x(Ax ∧ Ox)	7 eg		
	$Ai \land Oi \rightarrow \exists x(Ax \land \sim Ox)$	Pr1 ui		
	∃x(Ax ∧ ~Ox)	7 9 mp		
	$(\exists x(Ax \land Ox) \land \exists x(Ax \land \sim Ox))$	8 10 adj cd		
	Show $\sim Oi \rightarrow \exists x(Ax \land Ox) \land \exists x(Ax \land \sim Ox)$			
	~Oi	ass cd		
	Ai ∧ ~Oi	13 3 adj		
	∃x(Ax ∧ ~Ox)	14 eg		
	$Ai \land \sim Oi \rightarrow \exists x(Ax \land Ox)$	Pr2 ui		
	∃x(Ax ∧ Ox)	14 16 mp		
	$(\exists x(Ax \land Ox) \land \exists x(Ax \land \sim Ox))$	15 17 adj cd		
	$\exists x(Ax \land Ox) \land \exists x(Ax \land \neg Ox)$	4 5 12 sc		
		19 cd		
	\$	$\begin{array}{c c} \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \exists xAx \\ Ai \\ Oi \lor & Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \exists xAx \\ Ai \\ Oi \lor & Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} Oi \\ Ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} ai \land Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} Oi \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \hline \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \end{array} \\ \begin{array}{c} \end{array} \\ \end{array} $		

<Could also skip line 4 and use sc appealing only to lines 5 and 12.>

### **SECTION 9**

1. a. ~∃x(Ax ∨ Bx)  $\forall x \forall y (Gx \land Hy \rightarrow By)$ ∃xGx ∴ ∀x~Hx

1 <del>S</del> I	Show ∀x~Hx		
2	~∀x~Hx	ass id	
3	∃xHx	2 qn	
4	Hi	3 ei	
5	Gj	pr3 ei	
6	Gj ∧ Hi	4 5 adj	
7	$Gj \wedge Hi \rightarrow Bi$	pr2 ui ui	
8	Bi	6 7 mp	
9	∀x~(Ax ∨ Bx)	pr1 qn	
10	~(Ai ∨ Bi)	9 ui	
11	~Ai ∧ ~Bi	10 dm	
12	~Bi	11 s 8 id	

# b. $\exists x(Hx \land \neg \exists y(Gy \land Hx))$ $\therefore \forall y \sim Gy$

1	<del>Show</del> ∀y~Gy			
2	~∀y~Gy	ass id		
3	∃yGy	2 qn		
4	Hi ∧ ~∃y(Gy ∧ Hi)	pr1 ei		
5	Hi	4 s		
6	~∃y(Gy ∧ Hi)	4 s		
7	Gj	3 ei		
8	Gj ∧ Hi	5 7 adj		
9	∃y(Gy ∧ Hi)	8 eg 6 id		

c. 
$$\forall x(Ax \rightarrow \forall y(Bx \leftrightarrow By))$$
  
 $\exists zBz$   
 $\therefore \forall y(Ay \rightarrow By)$ 

1 Show $\forall y(Ay \rightarrow By)$					
2	Sh	Show $\forall i(Ai \rightarrow Bi)$			
3		Sh	<del>ow</del> Ai → Bi		
4			Ai	ass cd	
5			$Ai \rightarrow \forall y (Bi \leftrightarrow By)$	pr1 ui	
6			∀y(Bi ↔ By)	4 5 mp	
7			Bj	pr2 ei	
8			Bi ↔ Bj	6 ui	
9			Bi	8 bc 7 mp cd	
10				3 ud	
11	∀y	(Ay	$\rightarrow$ By)	2 av dd	

d. 
$$\neg \forall x(Dx \lor Ex)$$
  
 $\exists x(Fx \leftrightarrow \neg Ex) \rightarrow \forall zDz$   
 $\therefore \exists x \neg Fx$ 

1	Show Jx~Fx	
2	~∃x~Fx	ass id
3	∀xFx	2 qn
4	∃x~(Dx ∨ Ex)	pr1 qn
5	~(Di ∨ Ei)	4 ei
6	~Di ∧ ~Ei	5 dm
7	~Di	6 s
8	~Ei	6 s
9	<del>Show</del> Fi → ~Ei	
10	~Ei	8 r cd
11	Show ~Ei $\rightarrow$ Fi	
12	Fi	3 ui cd
13	Fi ↔ ~Ei	9 11 cb
14	∃x(Fx ↔ ~Ex)	13 eg
15	∀zDz	14 pr2 mp
16	Di	15 ui 7 id

e.  $Jc \land \neg Jd$  $\forall xKx \lor \forall x \neg Kx$  $\exists x(Jx \land Kx) \rightarrow \forall x(Kx \rightarrow Jx)$  $\therefore \neg Kc$ 

1 <del>S</del>	how ~Kc	
2	Kc	ass id
3	<del>Show</del> ∼∀x~Kx	
4	∀x~Kx	ass id
5	~Kc	4 ui
6	Kc	2 r 5 id
7	∀xKx	3 pr2 mtp
8	Jc ∧ Kc	pr1 s 2 adj
9	∃x(Jx ∧ Kx)	8 eg
10	$\forall x(Kx \rightarrow Jx)$	9 pr3 mp
11	$Kd \rightarrow Jd$	10 ui
12	Kd	7 ui
13	Jd	11 12 mp
14	~Jd	pr1 s 13 id

### **SECTION 10**

1. a.  $\forall x(Ax \rightarrow \exists y(By \land \sim Ay))$ ~∀xBx  $\sim \exists x(Bx \land Cx)$  $\therefore \exists x(Ax \land Cx)$ Universe: {1, 2, 3} A: {1} B: {2} C: {3} b.  $\exists x(Dx \land Ex \land \sim Fx)$  $\exists x(\sim Dx \land \sim Ex)$  $\forall x(Ex \rightarrow Dx \lor Fx)$  $\therefore \forall x(\mathsf{D}x \land \mathsf{E}x \to \mathsf{\sim}\mathsf{F}x)$ Universe: {1, 2, 3} D: {1, 2} E: {1, 2} F: {1}  $\exists x(Fx \land Gx)$ c.  $\exists x(Fx \land \neg Gx)$  $\exists x (\sim Fx \land Gx)$  $\therefore \forall x (\sim Fx \rightarrow Gx)$ <requires more than three things in the universe> Universe: {1, 2, 3, 4} F: {2, 3} G: {1, 2} d.  $\forall x \exists y (Fx \leftrightarrow (Gy \lor Fx))$  $\therefore ~\exists xFx \rightarrow ~\exists xGx$ Universe: {1, 2} F: { } G: {1}

e.  $\begin{array}{ll} Ha \wedge \sim Hb \\ \forall x(Kx \rightarrow Hx \wedge Jx) \\ \exists x(Jx \wedge \sim Kx) \\ \therefore \ \exists x(Hx \wedge \sim Jx) \end{array}$ 

Universe: {1, 2} H: {1} J: {1,2} K: { } a --- 1 b --- 2

#### **SECTION 11**

1. For each of the following arguments use the method of expansions to determine whether the following is a counterexample for it or not.



a. 
$$\forall x(Hx \rightarrow \exists y(Fy \land \sim Hy))$$
  
 $\sim \forall xFx$   
 $\sim \exists x(Fx \land Gx)$   
 $\therefore \exists x(Hx \land Gx)$ 

The conclusion expands to:

 $(H1 \land G1) \lor (H2 \land G2) \lor (\textbf{H3} \land \textbf{G3})$ 

which is true because H3 and G3 are true. Since we have a true conclusion, we don't have a counterexample.

b.  $\exists x(Gx \land Hx \land \sim Fx) \\ \exists x(\sim Gx \land \sim Hx) \\ \forall x(Hx \rightarrow Gx \lor Fx) \\ \therefore \forall x(Gx \land Hx \rightarrow \sim Fx) \end{cases}$ 

The conclusion expands to:

 $(\text{G1} \land \text{H1} \rightarrow \text{~F1}) \land (\text{G2} \land \text{H2} \rightarrow \text{~F2}) \land (\text{G3} \land \text{H3} \rightarrow \text{~F3})$ 

which is true because the first conjunct has a false antecedent, the second conjunct has a false antecedent, and the third conjunct has a true consequent. Since we have a true conclusion, we don't have a counterexample.

c.  $\exists x(Fx \land Gx)$  $\exists x(Fx \land \neg Gx)$  $\exists x(\neg Fx \land Gx)$  $\therefore \forall x(\neg Fx \rightarrow Gx)$ 

The second premise expands to:

 $(F1 \wedge {\sim}G1) \vee (F2 \wedge {\sim}G2) \vee (F3 \wedge {\sim}G3)$ 

which is false because each disjunct is false. Since we have a false premise we don't have a counterexample.

d.  $\forall x \exists y(Fx \leftrightarrow (Gy \lor Fx))$  $\therefore \neg \exists xFx \rightarrow \neg \exists xGx$ 

The conclusion expands to:

 $\textbf{~(F1} \lor F2 \lor F3) \rightarrow \textbf{~(G1} \lor G2 \lor G3)$ 

which is true because the antecedent is false because its leftmost disjunct is true. Since we have a true conclusion we don't have a counterexample.

e. Ha  $\land \sim$ Hb  $\forall x(Fx \rightarrow Hx \land Gx)$   $\exists x(Gx \land \sim Fx)$  $\therefore \exists x(Hx \land \sim Gx)$ 

The second premise expands to:

 $(F1 \rightarrow H1 \land G1) \land (F2 \rightarrow H2 \land G2) \land (F3 \rightarrow H3 \land G3)$ 

which is false because the first conjunct has a true antecedent and a false consequent. Since we have a false premise, we don't have a counterexample.